



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF  
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

**June 7, 2018  
Lobby Hearing Room  
Rhodes State Office Tower  
Columbus, Ohio**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair, Lori Barreras, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

**Commissioners Present:**

Chair Lori Barreras  
Commissioner William Patmon  
Commissioner Madhu Singh  
Commissioner Juan Cespedes  
Commissioner Carolyn Peters

A quorum was present.

**OCRC Staff Present:**

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Darlene Newbern, Director of Operations; Stephanie Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Mary Turocy, Director of Public Affairs and Civic Engagement; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Inder Levesque, Acting Toledo Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Akron Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Kathy Haley-Ross, Acting Dayton Regional Supervisor; Beyan Asoba, Reconsideration Supervisor. Also in attendance was Lori Anthony, Chief – Civil Rights Section, Ohio Attorney General’s Office.

Chair Barreras welcomed everyone to the meeting.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the May 17, 2018 minutes. Second by Commissioner Peters.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

## CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

### 1. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review

Daniel J. Guthrie v. Rocky Ridge Condominium Association, Stephanie Harrison, Ex-President and BJ Myers, Property Manager for Patterson Merkle & Company, LLC

COLH1(45327)07032017

05-17-9812-8

22A-2017-02867F

A. Ruben Lopez v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services

COL71(45452)08182017

22A-2017-03426C

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Glenda Frost v. Matthew Jehn

COLE1(45665)11132017

22A-2018-00430F

Otis Davenport v. State of Ohio, Bureau of Worker's Compensation

COL71(45691)12012017

22A-2018-00634C

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Mardi Morantz v. Comfort Dental Whitehall

COLG1(45982)04022018

22A-2018-01816F

Christopher Westfall v. Rivello Archbold, LLC dba McDonald's

TOLB2(38622)08012017

22A-2017-03240C

Tyree L. Sherrer v. Cutter Apartments; Cutter Historic Apartments LLC; Wallick Properties Midwest LLC; Kourtney Dickinson, Manager; Eric Handy, Regional Supervisor; Lane Hurst, Residential Relations

TOLH6(26578)07152017

22A-2017-03151F

Edmund R. Papczun v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP

AKRA3(39115)07252017

22A-2017-03188C

Daniel A. Stomski v. Progressive Casualty Insurance Company

CLEA4(44173)08212017

22A-2017-03466C

Dionna Mann v. Vatterott Educational Centers, Inc.

CLE74(44190)08282017

22A-2017-03529C

## **Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Jurisdiction Finding and Grant for Further Review**

Bonnie M. McGriff v. Beavercreek City School District Board of Education  
DAYB6(26623)08092017  
22A-2017-03415C

Stefanie M. Lyons v. Hometown Urgent Care  
DAYB6(26628)08092017  
22A-2017-03398C

Bryan Phelps v. Makino  
DAYA6(27116)03262018  
22A-2018-01739C

## **2. Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant For Further Review**

Kaitlynn Heer v. Elena Mircea and IGM Associates, LLC  
COLH1(45369)07172017  
05-17-8834-8  
22A-2017-03082F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. The Enclave Unit Owners; Association and Christine Atchley, Property Manager  
COLH1(45395)07272017  
05-17-8835-8  
22A-2017-03178F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of deny medical accommodation of an emotional support dog due to the basis of disability

Kaitlynn Heer v. The Enclave Unit Owners' Association and Christine Atchley, Property Manager  
COLH1(45401)07172017  
05-17-9279-8  
22A-2017-03208F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of deny medical accommodation of an emotional support dog on the basis of disability

Zakiyyah Muhammad v. Ridi Accounting LLC dba Stop & Go Stores  
TOL72(38685)08292017  
22A-2017-03515C

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of race regarding the issue of harassment/hostile work environment upon discovery; No Probable Cause on the bases of race and retaliation on the issues of promotion, discipline, terms and conditions (hours cut) and termination.

## **3. Reconsideration by the Commission – Vacate Previous Finding of Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement After a Finding of Probable Cause**

Kevin Moore v. PNK (Ohio), LLC dba Belterra Park Gaming and Entertainment  
DAY76(26683)08282017 AMENDED  
22A-2017-03583C

**4. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Deny – Untimely**

Cherri Chattman v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction  
COL71(45910)03062018  
22A-2018-01508C

**5. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office**

Christina Henderson v. Brookdale Senior Living, Inc.  
DAY76(26039)11092016  
22A-2017-00575C  
Complaint No. 17-EMP-DAY-26039

**6. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation**

Raymond Wood v. International Union, United Automobile, Aerospace & Agricultural  
TOL72(38643)08092017  
22A-2017-03315C

Paula Y. Kelly v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services  
TOLB2(38892)12042017  
22A-2018-00725C

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of accommodation based on disability; No Probable Cause on the issue of being required to return to the office to perform telework based on age

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Natalie Ludy v. Cristina I. Burcica  
TOLH6(26775)08112017  
05-17-9463-8  
22A-2018-00140F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of harassment based on retaliation (engaged in protected activity/complained about housing discrimination); No Probable Cause on the issue of harassment, terms and conditions, advertising based on disability and familial status (presence of minor child); No Probable Cause on the issue of advertising, terms and conditions on the basis of retaliation

Melissa Koppus v. Kurtiss R. Hirt, Owner  
TOLH2(39825)09082017  
22A-2018-00928F

Linda Mullett v. Todd Cleavenger, Ohio Specialized Investments, Ltd., and Lori Sams  
AKRH3(39142)08182017  
22A-2017-03418F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause regarding retaliation & threats to evict; No Probable Cause regarding sex & disability

Adrienne Husty v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction  
CLE74(44212)09112018  
22A-2017-03697C

## **Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation - Continued**

Adam Latimer v. Surjit Sandhu, Anooppinder Sandhu, Sandhui & Associates, Inc., Bill Strait, Cathy Strait

CLEH4(44234)092222017 AMENDED

05-17-9714-8

22A-2017-03823F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Surjit Sandhu, Anooppinder Sandhu, Sandhui & Associates, Inc., Bill Strait, Cathy Strait

CLEH4(44260)10102017 AMENDED

05-18-9715-8

22A-2018-00152F

### **7. Issue Formal Complaint**

Ashlee M. Robinson v. Steadfast Management Company, Inc.

COLH1(45353)06132017

05-17-8559-8

22A-2017-03025F

Kari Gonzalez v. City of Toledo, Division of Fire and Rescue

TOL72(38567)06302017

22A-2017-02853C

Pamela D. Camper v. United Parcel Service, Inc.

TOLA2(38585)07102017

22A-2017-03039C

Paula Bennett v. United Parcel Service, Inc.

TOLA2(38626)08022017

22A-2017-03242C

Pamela D. Camper v. United Parcel Service, Inc.

TOLA2(38697)09082017

22A-2017-03603C

Heather Fugate(nee Murray) v. Abbott Laboratories dba Abbott Nutrition

DAY76(26521)06262017

22A-2017-02916C

### **8. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After A Finding of Probable Cause**

Jeannie Koepfer v. Beechmonth Racquet Club

DAYG6(26687)08302017

22A-2017-03582F

**9. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close**

Donna Takacs v. Parma Elk Lodge  
CLEG4(44400)12272017  
22A-2018-00857F

**10. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement**

Justin B. Kozubal v. The Scotts Miracle-Gro Company  
COLB1(45701)12012017  
22A-2018-00618C

Roberta L. Strawser v. South Central Ohio Job and Family Services  
COLB1(45929)03152018Amended  
22A-2018-01613C

Michael Larimer v. Riker Products, Inc.  
TOLB2(38935)12272017  
22A-2018-00867C

Nitaya McDonald v. The Cleveland Clinic Foundation  
CLE74(44560)03282018  
22A-2018-01824C

Sandra Ross v. Rainbow USA, Inc.  
DAYA6(27045)02222018  
22A-2018-01483C

Rita Hook v. Resourcing Edge, LLC  
ADRA1(45939)03202018  
22A-2018-01667C

Joseph Ety v. Asplundh Tree Expert, Inc.  
ADRB1(45964) 03292018  
22A-2018-01759C

Charlotte Bowers v. AMG Hartford, LLC c/o Adam Glickman, Registered Agent; Tonya Stewart, Regional Manager for AMG Realty Group; and AMG Realty Group, LLC c/o Morcolyn Karpas, Registered Agent  
ADRH1(45992)04052018  
22A-2018-01843F

Suzanne K. McCurdy v. CSP of Ohio, LLC  
ADRB2(39075)03152018  
22A-2018-01625C

## **Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued**

Michael Wheatley, Sr. v. Autoneum North America, Inc.  
ADRA2(39094)03262018  
22A-2018-01714C

Scott R. Towers, Jr. v. Ruan Logistics Corporation  
ADRB2(39098)03272018  
22A-2018-01733C

Nicole Wilson v. National Registered Agents, Inc. dba Securitas Security Services USA, Inc.  
ADRM3(39434)02272018  
22A-2018-01459C

Cherell Miller v. Serene Health Services  
ADR73(39435)02272018  
22A-2018-01468C

Stacie Swain v. Perfect Clarity, LLC dba Precious Hering/Zounds  
ADR73(39454)03082018  
22A-2018-01588C

Carla Novicky v. County of Trumbull, Office of Elderly Affairs  
ADRB3(39504)04102018  
22A-2018-01906C

Anita Stenson v. Long Lok Fasteners Corporation  
ADR76(27127)03292018  
22A-2018-01842C

Donetha Shephard v. Nephcare  
ADRA6(27134)04022018  
22A-2018-02026C

## **11. Withdrawal of Charge - Grant**

Robert Brady v. James A. Flax, Owner  
DAYH6(27026)02132018  
22A-2018-01355F

Robert Brady v. Doris H. McCall-Hammonds  
DAYH6(27027)02132018  
22A-2018-01356F

**12. Withdrawal of Charge – Request For Notice of Right To Sue**

Jill Patterson v. County of Stark, Sheriff's Office  
AKR73(39154)08242017AMENDED  
22A-2017-03500C

**13. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ**

Shardae Kelsor and Jaz Boyce v. Eric Hoffman, Owner; Jan Realty; and Shakita (Last Name Unknown)  
COLH1(45934)03172018  
22A-2018-01634F

Madalyne Ludovici v. Cambridge Intermediate School  
COLG1(45977)03302018  
22A-2018-01787F

Laura A. Chapman v. Fry Foods, Inc.  
TOLE2(39045)02232018  
22A-2018-01463F

Whitney Wilson v. Petermann LTD  
AKRE3(39456)03092018  
22A-2018-01590F

Mark Lattimore v. Kenyon College  
AKRE3(39463)03122018  
22A-2018-01612F

Cherell Miller v. Stone Crossing Skilled Care, LLC dba Glenwood Care and  
Rehabilitation  
AKR73(39470)03152018  
22A-2018-01662C

Ruscel Dudley v. Youngstown City School District  
AKRE3(39493)04032018  
22A-2018-01821F

Neil Kastor v. Bath Fitter  
AKRE3(39502)04092018  
22A-2018-01881F

Monique Garrett v. Red Lobster Restaurants LLC  
AKRE3(39509)04112018  
22A-2018-01912F

**No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ - Continued**

Brittany Roman v. Winterberry Village Enterprise, LTD  
CLEH4(44530)02012018  
22A-2018-02394F

Ronald Garr v. Lutheran Men Ministry  
CLEH4(44531)02262018  
22A-2018-01606F

Earl Wooten v. Village of Highland Heights  
CLEH4(44539)03182018  
22A-2018-02178F

Miya Browning v. Old Navy  
DAYE6(26669)09072017  
22A-2017-03672F

Stephanie Shipley v. Michelle Stumbo  
DAYH6(26821)09072017  
22A-2018-00385F

Sarah Helfrich v. Buckeye Ambulance  
DAYE6(26851)11172017  
22A-2018-00560F

Christy Werner v. Joey LNU, Landlord  
DAYH6(26955)12142017  
22A-2018-00960F

Brien J. Champion v. Finneytown Local School District  
DAYG6(26973)01182018  
22A-2018-01041F

Courtney Noble v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP  
DAYG6(27072)03072018  
22A-2018-01534F

Barry Dell v. Amazon.com CVG3  
DAYE6(27172)03072018  
22A-2018-02064C

**14. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss**

Deborah Kay Gibney and Brett Lewis Gibney for Brent Gibney v. The Franklin County Sheriff's  
Department  
COLG1(46031) 04182018  
22A-2018-01945F

## **No Jurisdiction – Dismiss – Continued**

Thomas Venditti v. St. Peters Catholic Church  
AKRG3(39414)02122018  
22A-2018-01338F

Alexander Swint v. State of Ohio, Bureau of Workers' Compensation  
AKRG3(39541)05042018  
22A-2018-02269F

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Reverend Pamela Pinkney-Butts v. Democratic Party  
CLEG4(44607)04242018  
22A-2018-02194F

Elizabeth Kumbong Amaazee v. JP Morgan Chase Bank  
DAYG6(27023)02122018  
22A-2018-01323F

Kimberly Lykins v. Grandview Outlet-Flooring Store  
DAY76(27174)04172018  
22A-2018-02037C

## **15. Administrative Closure**

Daniel J. Guthrie v. Rocky Ridge Condominium Association, Stephanie Harrison, Ex-President and BJ Myers, Property Manager for Patterson Merkle & Company, LLC  
COLH1(45327)07032017  
05-17-9812-8  
22A-2017-02867F

Katharina A.R. Snyder v. State of Ohio, Environmental Protection Agency  
AKR73(39523)04192018  
22A-2018-02052C

Ashley Davis v. DT-JC LLC, Adam Divelbiss and Don Thomas  
AKRH3(39535)04302018  
22A-2018-02123F

Dayna Dunbar v. Clyde Avenue LLC and Tony Karam  
AKRH3(39565)05062018  
22A-2018-02259F

Felicia Davis v. CareSource  
AKRB3(39572)05142018  
22A-2018-02302C

## **Administrative Closure – Continued**

Ashley Davis v. DT-JC LLC, Adam Divelbiss and Don Thomas  
AKRH1(46058)04302018  
22A-2018-02097F

Jeffery Oxendine v. Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland  
CLE74(44431)01172018  
22A-2018-01026C

Willie Davis-Cooper v. Wilbert, Inc. dba Wilbert Plastic Services  
CLE74(44615)05032018  
22A-2018-02201C

### **16. No Probable Cause – Dismiss**

Kathryn Braskie v. City of Columbus, Division of Police Division  
COL71(45357)07142017  
22A-2017-03065C

Andrea Edwards v. Community Housing Network  
COLB1(45385)07242017  
22A-2017-03154C

Ashley Turner v. FedEx Ground Package System, Inc.  
COL71(45424)08102017  
22A-2017-03321C

Jermaine Kennedy v. State of Ohio, Department of Education  
COL71(45425)08102017  
22A-2017-03327C

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Michael Aldridge v. Securitas Security Services USA, Inc.  
COLA1(45427)08112017  
22A-2017-03331C

Ebony Stevens v. OhioHealth Corporation  
COL71(45447)08162017  
22A-2017-03404C

Cheryl L. Whitten v. Intermedix Staffing, Inc.  
COLB1(45448)08162017  
22A-2017-03406C

Mardi Morantz v. The Barcus Company, Inc.  
COLH1(45449)08142017  
22A-2017-03409F

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Cathy Eileen Pope v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation  
COLA1(45451)08182017  
22A-2017-03423C

Audra Cassady v. New Wincup Holdings Inc.  
COL71(45455)08192017  
22A-2017-03428C

Chad Azeltine v. EAG Marketing  
COLB1(45462)08222017  
22A-2017-03444C

Ashley Turner v. FedEx Ground Package System, Inc.  
COL71(45463)08222017  
22A-2018-02464C

Abdourahim Dia v. The Ohio State University Wexner Medical Center  
COLA1(45470)08282017  
22A-2017-03494C

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Scott Schriever v. Franklin County Treasurer's Office  
COLB1(45488)09012017  
22A-2017-03563C

Nicole Tran v. Signature Dermatology  
COL71(45491)09042017  
22A-2017-03568C

Julia Seeli v. Dave Gill Chevrolet, Inc.  
COLF1(45511)09122017  
22A-2017-03684F

Jeremiah Hairston v. Licking Knox Goodwill at DSCC  
COL71(45571)10062017 AMENDED  
22A-2018-00071C

Venesia Atoyia Covington v. Linebarger Goggan Blair & Sampson, LLP  
COL71(45589) 10172017 AMENDED  
22A-2018-00168C

Rhonda D. Bennett v. Verizon Corporate Resources Group, LLC  
COLA1(45600)10202017  
22A-2018-00202C

Joseph A. Hairston v. Cassady Village Apartments  
COL71(45649)11072017  
22A-2018-00392C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Theresa Juah Boan v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction  
COL71(45674)11152017  
22A-2018-00486C

Venesia Atoyia Covington v. Linebarger Goggan Blair & Sampson, LLP  
COL71(45708)12072017  
22A-2018-00656C

Gladys Wallace v. Robin Christian, Property Manager at Jaycee Village Apartments and Barcus  
Company, Inc.  
COLH1(45710)12082017  
05-18-0665-8  
22A-2018-00707F

LaRon Hampton v. JKB Management Company dba Mortellaro's McDonald's  
COL71(45727)12152017  
22A-2018-00769C

Kimberly Johnson v. Jax 1, LLC  
COLG1(45734)12182017  
22A-2018-00804F

Maria Welch v. CSC ServiceWorks, Inc.  
COL71(45742)12202017  
22A-2018-00820C

Sophie Reeves (Heather Reeves-Parent) v. Hugs-N-Hearts Early Learning Center, Inc  
COLG1(45796)01172018 Amended  
22A-2018-00988F

Maris (Fran) Ward v. Meijer Stores Limited Partnership  
COLG1(45804)01182018  
22A-2018-01057F

Eugene Baker, Jr. v. Abbott Nutrition  
COLA1(45815)01232018  
22A-2018-01119C

Kathleen M. DiRenna v. Charter Communications, LLC  
COLA1(45828)01282018  
22A-2018-01132C

Frederick Prindle v. COTA  
COL71(45843)02022018  
22A-2018-01202C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

LaRon Hampton v. JKB Management Company dba Mortellaro's McDonald's  
COL71(45851)02082018  
22A-2018-01254C

LaRon Hampton v. JKB Management Company dba Mortellaro's McDonald's  
COL71(45940)01092018  
532-2018-00354

Kent A. Stephens v. Tiffany Needles, Manager; Berkley House, LLC c/o Michael J. Kenney,  
Registered Agent  
COLH1(45983)04022018  
05-18-1115-8  
22A-2018-01796F

Jeffery Heffelfinger v. Kasai North America, Inc.  
TOLB2(38665)08162017  
22A-2017-03414C

Stella R. Barringer v. Lucas County Juvenile Justice Center  
TOL72(38675)08222017  
22A-2017-03476C

Yvonne Johnson v. AVI Food Systems, Inc.  
TOLB2(38680)08242017  
22A-2017-03482C

Theresa Beard v. Mondelez Global LLC  
TOLB2(38682)08252017  
22A-2017-03484C

Linley A. Pickett v. Adecco USA, Inc.  
TOL72(38687)08292017  
22A-2017-03585C

Ericka Bonds v. The Epilepsy Center of Northwest Ohio  
TOLA2(38690)08312017  
22A-2017-03589C

DeAndre D. Taylor v. FCA US LLC  
TOL72(38695)09062017  
22A-2017-03599C

Amanda J. Moronti-Forster v. Rescue Mental Health & Addiction Services  
TOLB2(38696)09072017  
22A-2017-03600C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Kevin D. Rushing v. City of Toledo  
TOL72(38700)09112017  
22A-2017-03626C

Robert M. Hawkins v. Haas Door Company  
TOLA2(38709)09182017  
22A-2017-03743C

Kevia M. Dorsey v. Fresh Products, LLC  
TOL72(38711)09182017  
22A-2017-03745C

Charlotte G. Rollen v. Valley Services, Inc.  
TOLA2(38714)09192017  
22A-2017-03748C

Merle Y. Stokes v. FCA US LLC  
TOL72(38715)09192017  
22A-2017-03749C

Donta L. Wells v. Autoneum North America, Inc.  
TOL72(38719)09192017  
22A-2017-03754C

Andrew C. Bernritter v. Lucas County Sheriff's Office  
TOL72(38720)09192017  
22A-2017-03765C

Merle Y. Stokes v. FCA US LLC  
TOL72(38724)09252017  
22A-2017-03812C

Shawntia Easter v. The University of Toledo Medical Center  
TOL72(38725)09262017  
22A-2018-00004C

Rebecca Brown v. ProMedica Physicians Adult Medicine Clinic  
TOLA2(38727)09272017  
22A-2018-00006C

Jocelyn Phillips v. Bemis Company, Inc.  
TOL72(38728)09272017  
22A-2018-00007C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Paula Y. Kelly v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services  
TOLB2(38892)12042017  
22A-2018-00725C

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of accommodation based on disability; No Probable Cause on the issue of being required to return to the office to perform telework based on age

\*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Arthur Stanton v. Erie Land Co LLC, Owner; Elisha Miller, Manager; The Woda Group, Inc  
TOLH2(38926)09172017  
22A-2018-00949F

Natalie Ludy v. Cristina I. Burcica  
TOLH6(26775)08112017  
05-17-9463-8  
22A-2018-00140F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of harassment based on retaliation (engaged in protected activity/complained about housing discrimination); No Probable Cause on the issue of harassment, terms and conditions, advertising based on disability and familial status (presence of minor child); No Probable Cause on the issue of advertising, terms and conditions on the basis of retaliation

Jennifer Kendrick Nee Padgitt v. Concordia of Ohio dba Concordia at Sumner  
AKRB3(39079)07062017  
22A-2017-03035C

Kathy Goodwin v. Denone LLC dba Denny's  
AKRB3(39112)07212017  
22A-2017-03184C

Linda Mullett v. Todd Cleavenger, Ohio Specialized Investments, Ltd., and Lori Sams  
AKRH3(39142)08182017  
22A-2017-03418F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause regarding retaliation & threats to evict; No Probable Cause regarding sex & disability

Terry Darr v. Encore Rehabilitation Services, LLC  
AKRB3(39150)08232017  
22A-2017-03459C

Deborah Watson v. Astro Shapes LLC  
AKRB3(39155)08252017  
22A-2017-03502C

Janice Graham v. Kare Condominium Management Co., and Mark Gutowski  
AKRH3(39170)09062017  
05-17-9736-8  
22A-2017-03639F

Druvae Wise v. All-Tech Manufacturing Ltd.  
AKR73(39174)09072017  
22A-2017-03829C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Arthur Frazier v. Café Toscano, Inc.  
AKRG3(39209)09192017  
22A-2017-03840F

Lamont Johnson v. Aris Teleradiology Professional Corporation  
AKR73(39243)10222017  
22A-2018-00212C

Christina Rainwater v. BNS Properties, LLC, Timothy Sigmund and Jay Ballinger  
AKRH3(39302)12022017  
05-18-0591-8  
22A-2018-00614F

Canice Guice v. Highland Square Mustard Seed Market, LLC dba Mustard Seed Market and Café  
AKR73(39307)12042017  
22A-2018-00621C

Katie Lauer v. Sateri Home, Inc.  
AKR73(39380)01292018  
22A-2018-01215C

Tara Hatcher v. State of Ohio, Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services, Northcoast Behavioral Healthcare  
AKRB3(39392)02012018  
22A-2018-01262C

Gwendolyn Miller v. The Mills Creek Association and Lisa Madden  
CLEH4(44218)09182017  
05-17-9890-8  
22A-2017-03757F

Yteva Thompson v. Landerwood Glen Condominium Number One owner Association, Inc., Howard Danzinger, and Judy Pace  
CLEH4(44225)09202017  
05-17-0017-8  
22A-2017-03801F

John G. Bruce Sr. v. TA Operating, LLC  
CLEB4(44241)09252017  
22A-2017-03811C

Lyndee Heinze v. Chipotle Mexican Grill Inc.  
CLEA4(44270)10172017  
22A-2018-00185C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Andrea R. Francis v. Heat & Frost Insulators Union Local #3  
CLE74(44278)10202017  
22A-2018-00238C

Kevin Robinson v. Automated Packaging Systems, Inc.  
CLE74(44347)11212017  
22A-2018-00539C

Norman Hall Jr. v. Chipotle Mexican Grill Inc.  
CLE74(44409)01052018  
22A-2018-00993C

Ellen Cuthbert v. PC Power LLC  
CLEE4(44410)01052018  
22A-2018-00994F

Angela Bailey v. The Cleveland Clinic Foundation  
CLE74(44429)01182018  
22A-2018-01024C

Alex Case v. DaVitan dba DaVita Sandusky Dialysis Center  
CLEH4(44443)01192018  
22A-2018-01449F

John Welcome v. JakPrints, Inc.  
CLE74(44454)01262018  
22A-2018-01163C

Christopher Kubin v. Bad Spirits LLC dba Funhouse  
CLEG4(44489)02212018  
22A-2018-01449F

David Ibeziako v. Amazon.com dedc, LLC  
CLE74(44492)02222018  
22A-2018-01453C

Rev. Pamela Pinkney-Butts v. University Hospitals Health Systems, Inc. dba  
University Hospitals  
CLEG4(44501)02222018  
22A-2018-01475F

Ronald Garr v. Ohio Means Jobs/Cleveland-Cuyahoga County  
CLE74(44518)02282018  
22A-2018-01542C

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Karen Davis v. Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc.  
CLEG4(44521)03062018  
22A-2018-01563F

Michael Boyd v. Standby Screw Machine Products Company  
CLEB4(44534)03142018  
22A-2018-01655C

James Berndt v. KeyBank  
CLEG4(44545)03232018  
22A-2018-01144C

Angel Whitmore v. Keis George LLP  
CLEG4(44551)03282018  
22A-2018-01794F

Lanicia Cunningham v. ContactUS, LLC  
CLEA1(45721)12122017  
22A-2018-00713C

Rosalie Schneider v. Professional Travel, Inc.  
CLEA1(45728)12152017  
22A-2018-00802C

Mary Smith v. United Parcel Services, Inc.  
CLE71(45818)01242018  
22A-2018-01094C

Lakeisha Track v. Unique Health Care Solutions, LLC  
CLE72(38917)12132017  
22A-2018-00787C

Jennifer R. Fairall v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation  
CLEB3(39428)02222018  
22A-2018-01480C

Debra Lee Spellman v. Parag Modi, D.M.D., Inc. d/b/a Aspen Dental  
DAYA6(26649)08142017  
22A 2017-03434C

Carol Fails v. Lima City School District Board of Education  
DAY76(26680)08232017  
22A-2017-03557C

Charla Reeves v. Salon J Ladner & Spa  
DAYE6(26704)09062017  
22A-2017-03618F

**No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued**

Tyquan Davis-Jackson v. Fuyao Glass America  
DAY76(26713)09122017  
22A-2017-03719C

Debbie Bishop v. Emery Oleochemical  
DAYB6(26749)09292017  
22A-2018-00060C

Camille King v. City of Cincinnati, Department of Transportation and Engineering  
DAYB6(26956)01112018  
22A-2018-01013C

Loria Clark v. Kao USA Inc.  
DAY76(26969)01182018  
22A-2018-01038C

Loria Clark v. BelFlex Staffing Network, LLC  
DAY76(26970)01182018  
22A-2018-01045C

Keisha Huff v. Cincinnati Children’s Hospital Medical Center  
DAY76(26982)01252018  
22A-2018-01126C

James Hall v. Lima Interfaith Senior Housing  
DAY76(27132)03302018  
22A-2018-02022C

Andre Sherod v. Bimbo Bakeries USA, Inc.  
DAY71(45480)08312017  
22A-2017-03526C

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the June 7, 2018 Confirmation Agenda. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

## STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Director reported that the Commission had complied with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requests that the following appearance case be removed from today's Agenda:

### **Week 2, Page 1, Item II-A**

Mary Lugar v. Ohio Living Home Health - Greater Columbus  
COLB1(45521)09152017  
22A-2017-03718C

At the Respondent's request, this case was rescheduled for the June 28, 2018 Commission meeting.

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the Staff Briefing. Second by Commissioner Singh.**

### **Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

## APPEARANCE CASES

### Appearance 1

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 1, Page 2, Item II-B

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Reverse No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Sheryl Seigel v. SWX Cleveland, LLC  
CLE74(44117)07202017  
22A-2017-03132C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reverse the previous finding of No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation. The Charging Party was present to discuss the case. The Respondent failed to appear.

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reverse the original finding of No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation. Second by Commissioner Peters.**

#### Roll Call Vote:

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

Appearance 2

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause

Ashlee Robinson v. Lauren Epps, Manager, Stephanie Townsend, Regional Property Manager for Steadfast Management Company, Inc.; Steadfast Management Company, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System, Registered Agent; and Hilliard Partners, LLC c/o Rajagopalan Venkatran  
COLH1(45353)06132017 AMENDED  
05-17-8559-8  
22A-2017-03025F

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause against Respondent Lauren Epps, Manager, Stephanie Townsend, Regional Property Manager for Steadfast Management Company, Inc.; Steadfast Management Company, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System, Registered Agent; No Probable Cause Against Respondents Hilliard Partners, LLC c/o Rajagopalan Venkatran

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission uphold the previous finding of Probable. The parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to uphold the original finding of Probable Cause. Second by Commissioner Singh.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

**Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1**  
**Page 1 of 1**

**1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause**

Sammie L. Coleman, Jr. v. City of Toledo, Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor  
TOL72(38575)07052017  
22A-2017-02950C

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of disqualification from working as Alternate General Foreman based on race and retaliation;  
No Probable Cause on the issue of discipline based on race and retaliation

**2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss**

Sammie L. Coleman, Jr. v. City of Toledo, Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor  
TOL72(38575)07052017  
22A-2017-02950C

\*Split Determination: No Probable Cause on the issue of discipline based on race and retaliation; Probable Cause on the issue of disqualification from working as Alternate General Foreman based on race and retaliation

LaVonda Johnson v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities  
TOL72(38607)07242017  
22A-2017-03224C

**MOTION by Commissioner Singh to adopt the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

**Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2**  
**Page 1 of 1**

**1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss**

Roger D. Beisner v. YMCA of Darke County, Inc.  
DAYG6(26987)01292018  
22A-2018-01239F

**2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Jurisdiction - Dismiss**

Georgia Cox v. Dayton Public Schools Board of Education  
DAY76(26930)12222017  
22A-2018-00843F

**MOTION by Commissioner Peters to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2. Second by Commissioner Singh.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

**Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3**  
**Page 1 of 2**

**1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause**

Kaitlynn Heer v. Elena Mircea and IGM Associates, LLC  
COLH1(45369)07172017  
05-17-8834-8  
22A-2017-03082F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. The Enclave Unit Owners;  
Association and Christine Atchley, Property Manager  
COLH1(45395)07272017  
05-17-8835-8  
22A-2017-03178F

Kaitlynn Heer v. The Enclave Unit Owners' Association  
and Christine Atchley, Property Manager  
COLH1(45401)07172017  
05-17-9279-8  
22A-2017-03208F

David A. Ward v Hemm's Glass Shops, Inc.  
DAY76(26836)11132017  
22A-2018-00573C

\*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of retaliation, issue of termination; No Probable Cause on the basis of sex, issue of harassment

**2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss**

Tyree L. Sherrer v. Cutter Apartments; Cutter Historic Apartments LLC; Wallick Properties Midwest  
LLC; Kourtney Dickinson, Manager; Eric Hendy, Regional Supervisor; Lane Hurst, Resident Relations  
TOLH6(26578)07152017  
22A-2017-03151F

**3. Upon Remand: Consideration of Administrative Law Judge's Amended Report and  
Recommendation to Issue a Dismissal Order; Complainant's Statement of Objections Thereto**

Camille Barnes v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities  
TOLB2(36834)10162015  
22A-2015-00125C  
Complaint No. 15-EMP-TOL-36834

Camille Barnes v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities  
TOLB2(37200)06082015  
22A-2015-02065C  
Complaint No. 16-EMP-TOL-37200

**Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3**  
**Page 2 of 2**

**MOTION by Commissioner Singh to deny Complainant's objections and adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

## **Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office**

Lori Anthony, Civil Rights Section Chief – Ohio Attorney General's Office reported on the ruling of the United States Supreme Court regarding *Masterpiece Cakeshop, LTD. v. Colorado Civil Rights Commission*. The court felt the underlying investigation by the Colorado Civil Rights Commission was biased against the cake shop owner's religion. According to Ms. Anthony, the case has little precedential value.

## **Report from the Chief Legal Counsel**

Chief Legal Counsel Stephanie Demers also reported on the U.S. Supreme Court's recent decision in *Masterpiece Cakeshop, LTD. v. Colorado Civil Rights Commission*. She echoed the opinion of AAG Lori Anthony that the case has little precedential value. She stated it is unfortunate the Court punted on the important issue of what takes priority – statutory law prohibiting discrimination or the First Amendment freedom of speech and/or religion and sends the message that as public officials, we must be careful in our open communications and communication with the public. She also took the opportunity to discuss how the housing case that was heard could be linked to an adverse employment action and discussed the meaning and nuances of the Ohio retaliation statutes, R.C. 4112.02(H)(12) and 4112.02(I)..

## **Report from Executive Director**

Executive Director, G. Michael Payton expressed his concerns regarding the U.S. Supreme Court's decision in *Masterpiece Cakeshop, LTD. v. Colorado Civil Rights Commission*. The decision potentially opens the door for more discrimination against other groups using religion as a defense. He also expressed concerns regarding the court's decision regarding arbitration clauses. It disenfranchises a broad group of the population.

Second Annual Project Snapshot: The Commission held a reception in Central office with photography students from the Cleveland and Cincinnati area on June 1<sup>st</sup>. This marks the second annual reception in partnership with the Ohio Arts Council. Director Payton thanked Chair Barreras and Commission Cespedes for attending the event. He commended the efforts of Vera Boggs and Diane Benaugh who met with the students to provide an overview of civil rights. He also thanked Mary Turocy for coordinating the event.

Beyan Asoba – An Extraordinary Story: Beyan Asoba, who was born and raised in Ethiopia, was one of only five people selected from around the world by its Prime Minister to return to Ethiopia to meet with the present government and discuss reforms and democratization of the country. This visit marks the first time Beyan has returned home since leaving for college in 1985. Beyan briefly shared his experience during the meeting.

Passing of former Chairman Aaron Wheeler Sr.: Former Chairman Aaron Wheeler Sr. passed away on May 22, 2018 in Virginia Beach, Virginia. Mr. Wheeler, who was born and raised in East Cleveland, was an extraordinary person who had a deep passion for the enjoyment of civil rights and the elimination of gang violence. He was a pastor who was also affectionately known as "Preacherman." He served as a Commissioner from 2000 to 2008 and we thank him for all that he did for the agency and the State of Ohio.

Mary Turocy introduced extern Julie Lam. Julie is a Communications major at Denison University. She will spend the summer working directly with Mary in the department of Public Affairs and Civic Engagement.

**Remarks**

Commissioner Peters expressed appreciation and thanked Stephanie and the interns for assisting her with cases. Commissioner Singh congratulated Beyan Asoba on his journey to Ethiopia. Commissioner Cespedes thanked everyone who attended the Project Snapshot reception. Commissioner Patmon shared the news of his son graduating from Saint Charles Preparatory School.

**MOTION by Commissioner Singh to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

<b>Chair Lori Barreras</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner William W. Patmon, III</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Madhu Singh</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Juan Cespedes</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Commissioner Carolyn Peters</b>	<b>YES</b>

**Motion carried.**

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 11:30AM.



\* \* \*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Commissioner