



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION
February 22, 2018
Lobby Hearing Room
Rhodes State Office Tower
Columbus, Ohio**

CALL TO ORDER

Acting Chairman Patmon called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Commissioner William Patmon
Commissioner Lori Barreras
Commissioner Juan Cespedes

Absent:

Chairman Leonard Hubert
Commissioner Madhu Singh

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Darlene Newbern, Director of Operations; Stephanie Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Mary Turocy, Director of Public Affairs and Civic Engagement; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing Enforcement and Alternative Dispute Resolution; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Akron Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Duffy Jamieson, Dayton Regional Supervisor; Beyan Asoba, Reconsideration Supervisor; Sharon Tassie, Assistant Chief – Civil Rights Section, Ohio Attorney General’s Office.

Acting Chairman Patmon welcomed everyone to the meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to approve the February 1, 2018 minutes. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. **Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review**

Valoree Ohl v. City of Toledo
TOLA2(38419)04192017
22A-2017-01913C

Hamad Hamad v. MBL Management, Inc. and Westtown Gardens LLC
AKRH4(44132)07072017 AMENDED
05-17-8672-8
22A-2017-03217F

Laurel Thomas v. The PNC Financial Services Group, Inc.
CLEA4(44181)08232017
22A-2017-03469C

Patrick D. Pisano v. Tempcraft Corporation dba Arconic
CLEA4(44328)11092017
22A-2018-00437C

Teresa Hart v. Sally Beauty Supply, LLC
DAYB6(26426)05122017
22A-2017-02482C

2. **Withdrawal of Charge – Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office**

Carteria Pace v. Charter Communications, LLC
AKR73(38493)08222016
22A-2016-02664C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-AKR-38493

Angelo Harper v. Charter Communications, LLC
AKR73(38605)11012016
22A-2017-00314C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-AKR-38605

Carteria Pace v. Charter Communications, LLC
AKR73(38609)11032016
22A-2017-00318C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-AKR-38609

Marino Watts v. City of Cleveland, Department of Port Authority
CLE74(43570)08302016
22A-2016-02700C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-CLE-43570

3. Withdrawal of Charge – Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Alfie Beale v St. Clare Commons
TOL72(37786)05112016
22A-2016-01784C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-TOL-37786

Kamila Fordham v St. Clare Commons
TOL72(37801)05172016
22A-2016-01817C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-TOL-37801

Linda Freeman v. Deegan Management, Inc., et al.
CLEH4(43511)07192016
05-16-4908-8
22A-2016-02422F
Complaint No. 17-HOU-CLE-43511

Dwayne Sharpe v. City of Dayton
DAYB6(25758)06212016
22A-2016-02157C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-DAY-25758

4. Withdrawal of Charge – Request for a Notice of Right to Sue; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Rolanda Lloyd v. Greater Cleveland Transit Authority
CLE74(43577)08312016
22A-2016-02718C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-CLE-43577

5. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Sherry Adepitan-Ogunjobi v. Joyce Cahaan
COLH1(44048)01282016
05-16-4266-8
22A-2016-01159F
Complaint No. 16-HOU-COL-44048

Linda Gerdeman v. East Garden Apartments
TOLH2(37708)04042016
05-16-4517
22A-2016-01353F
Complaint No. 17-HOU-TOL-37708

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office - Continued

Cody Frye v. Autoneum North America, Inc.
TOL72(37999)09062016
22A-2016-02743C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-TOL-37999

Vondricka Huff v. Walgreen Co.
CLEB4(43385)05062016
22A-2016-01745C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-CLE-43385

Marquita Jones v. Dish One Up Satellite, Inc. dba Dish 1 Up Satellites
CLE74(43490)07122016
22A-2016-02275C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-CLE-43490

Shyunte Dabney v. Dish One Up Satellite, Inc. dba Dish 1 Up Satellites
CLE74(43507)07252016
22A-2016-02419C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-CLE-43507

6. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Ability Center of Greater Toledo v. Contour Toledo, LLC; Steven L. Diller, Statutory Agent; City of Toledo
TOLH2(38363)03232017
22A-2017-01646F

Tammy VanRiper v. General Motors LLC
TOL72(38433)04272017
22A-2017-02051C

Mark Price v. Leah Stanovich
AKRH3(39050)06162017
05-17-8936-8
22A-2017-02769F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of disability and religion; No Probable Cause on the basis of sex.

7. Issue Formal Complaint

Jennifer Lynn Bailey v. Hope Crow and Tracy Grewell
AKRH3(38989)05092017
05-17-8178-8
22A-2017-02295F

8. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After a Finding of Probable Cause – Close

Judi Patrizi v. Medina County Public Defenders Office
CLEB4(43896)03122017
22A-2017-01614C

Johana Steward v. Treetop Daycare, Inc.
CLEE4(44040)060852017
22A-2017-02627F

9. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement After a Finding of Probable Cause – Close

Charletta D. Slaughter v. Huntington National Bank; Todd R. Roth, Mortgage Loan Officer, Huntington National Bank
TOLH2(38318)02272017
05-17-7693-8
22A-2017-01469F

10. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close

Crystal Smith v. Hondo Imwalle
AKRH6(26650)08052017
05-17-9945-8
22A-2017-03486F

Kathleen Curtis v. Cavaliers Operating Company, LLC dba Cavs Scream Team
CLE74(44155)08142017
22A-2017-03362C

Monique Robinson v. Rainbow USA Inc.
DAYG6(26783)10162017
22A-2018-00196F

Kathleen Robinson v. Rainbow USA Inc.
DAYG6(26784)10162017
22A-2018-00197F

Lori Dukes v. Raymond Smith, Eric Ward, and RESCO Realty
ADRH1(45759)01022018
05-18-0407-8
22A-2018-00889F

Robin Jefferson v. Lucas Metropolitan Housing Authority
ADRH2(38693)08312017
05-17-0576-8
22A-2017-03594F

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close - Continued

Jalica Corley v. City of Dayton, Department of Recreation and Services
ADR76(26933)12282017
22A-2018-00902C

11. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement

Theodis L. Greer v. Heartland Employment Services, LLC
TOLB2(38639)08072017
22A-2017-03297C

Cassandra Payne v. Waterstone Properties, LLC
CLEE4(44295)08072017
532-2017-01408F

Kelly Fanger v. Samar Financial Group, Inc.
CLEB4(44407)01032018
22A-2018-00989C

Chris Thomas v. ORBIS Corporation
DAYB6(26469)05262017
22A-2017-02497C

Gail Palmer v. Shawnee Place Apartments; Joanna Baugh, Property Manager, et al.
DAYH6(26527)06282017
22A-2017-02917F

Tasha Coleman v. Pristine Senior Living of Norwood Towers, LLC
DAY76(26673)08232017
22A-2017-03489C

Mary Watkins v. Nehemiah Manufacturing Company LLC
DAYB6(26872)12042017
22A-2018-00680C

Thomas Harford v. Advance Printing & Graphics
ADRA1(45689)11292017 AMENDED
22A-2018-00572C

Michael Dozier v. Abbie Cove
ADRH1(45700)12052017 AMENDED
05-18-0145-8
22A-2018-00617F

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued

Adam Joseph Root v. Jegs
ADR71(45720)12112017
22A-2018-00712C

Kirk D. Turns v. First Communities Management
ADR71(45740)12202017
22A-2018-00811CC

Alysia M. Bradley v. Ohio Heating and Refrigeration
ADR71(45744)12222017
22A-2018-00836C

James Wright and Barbara Wright v. Red Doors of Toledo; John Howard
ADRH2(38775)10132017
05-18-0606-8
22A-2018-00130F

Melissa Faulkner v. Industrial Power Systems, Inc.
ADR72(38794)10262017
22A-2018-00269C

Richard Tuggle, Sr. v. Genacross Lutheran Services/Genacross Family & Youth Services
ADR72(38862)11202017
22A-2018-00660C

Tammie Mallory v. St. Luke's Hospital
ADR72(38895)12052017
22A-2018-00729C AMENDED

Lindsey Day v. Imagine Schools, Inc.
ADR72(38911)12112017
22A-2018-00773C

Dianna Dressel v. Puckett's Corral, LLC dba Golden Corral
ADRA2(38913)12112017
22A-2018-00775C

Darrell Canty v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
ADRG2(38919)12152017
22A-2018-00781F

Emily Marie Gifford v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
ADRG3(39222)09292017
22A-2018-00031F

Rebecca Mae Coxson v. Samuel Son & Co., Inc.
ADRA3(39293)11152017
22A-2018-00556C

12. Withdrawal of Charge - Grant

Howard Bailey v. Licking/Knox Goodwill Industries, Inc.
COL71(45525)09152017
22A-2017-03723C

Mitchell DeVan v. Yelena Ganyukov, Viktor Gavrylyuk and Georgetown of Lyndhurst Condominiums
Unit Owners' Association
AKRH4(44137)07132017
05-17-9174-8
22A-2017-03351F

*Split Determination: Withdrawal of Charge on the issues regarding Respondent Yelena Ganyukov and Respondent Georgetown of Lyndhurst
Condominiums Unit Owners' Association; No Probable Cause on issues regarding Respondent Viktor Gavrylyuk

Geraldine L. Howard v. William Kohler, owner
DAYH6(26539)06292017
22A-2017-02920F

Joseph Mowers vs. Jesse Earley, Roost Realty
DAYH6(26906)12052017
22A-2018-00730F

Ashley M. Stewart v. Holiday Inn Express
ADRA2(38909)12102017
22A-2018-00771C

13. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ

Tonya Nanthavong v. OHP Ohio Hospital for Psychiatry
COLE1(45541)09212017
22A-2017-03779F

Karl Murray v. Primas Property Management
COLH1(45226)05182017
22A-2017-02547F

Sabrina Barron v. Nikou Learning Center
COLE1(45274)06092017
22A-2017-02661F

Janet Diana Morris v. Comenity Bank
COLG1(45281)06122017
22A-2017-02685F

Amanda Fannin v. Dr. Julia Jeng Chen, Merritta Clinic
COLG1(45499)09062017
22A-2017-03576F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ – Continued

Jo Anne Johnson v. Topaz Real Estate Inc.
COLH1(45507)09082017
22A-2017-03644F

Christopher Gass v. Dick's Sporting Goods
COLE1(45572)10102017
22A-2018-00097F

Delaney Zweydorff v. New Life Multi Family Management LLC
COLH1(45586)10162017
22A-2018-00142F

Ricky McGruder v. Randy Gornall, Maintenance
COLH1(45604)10212017
22A-2018-00209F

Ricky McGruder v. Lynn Fisher, Owner/Manager
COLH1(45606)10212017
2A-2018-00215F

Marie Sartor v. Pilot Flying J Logistics
COLE1(45638)11022017
22A-2018-00349F

Samantha Robinson v. Zanesville Metropolitan Housing Authority c/o Steve Randles, Executive Director; Trulight Ministries; and Christina Swartz, Co-founder of Trulight Ministries
COLH1(45643)09202017 AMENDED
22A-2018-00357F

Lawrence Ahart v. Metro Mechanical, Inc.
COLE1(45657)11102017
22A-2018-00420F

Amanda Fannin v. Scotland Yard Condominiums
COLH1(45685)11222017
22A-2017-00547F

Paula Hauer v. FedEx Ground
COLE1(45709)12072017
22A-2018-00652F

Kelsey Girlie v. Medici Payroll Company LLC
COLE1(45848)02052018
22A-2018-01221F

Melissa Green v. Chesapeake Pointe Apartments, LLC
AKRH3(39404)01242018
22A-2018-01259F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ - Continued

Jeremy Callan v. Dolgen Midwest, LLC dba Dollar General
CLEG4(44353)11282017
22A-2018-00577F

Karen Jamison v. Frederick A. Perdue, Owner
DAYH6(26421)05092017
22A-2017-02572F

Hameed Juma v. Van Buren Village Apartments
DAYH6(26488)06032017
22A-2017-02877F

Sherita Scroggins v. DMHA
DAYH6(26681)08232017
05-17-9481-8
22A-2017-03558F

Franklin & Gwendolyn Harris v. Daniel & Kaylay Cooley
DAYH6(26774)06122017
05-17-9481-8
22A-2018-00139F

Danyelle White v. Judson Care Center
DAYE6(26856)11222017
22A-2018-00565F

Vernellia Randall v. United States Postal Service
DAYG6(26913)12152017
22A-2018-00791F

Wesley Cutlip v. Take 5 Oil Change
DAYE6(26971)01122018
22A-2018-01039F

Bryan Edwards v. Jeff Schmitt Auto Group
DAYE6(26984)01242018
22A-2018-01117F

14. Administrative Closure

Anna M. Hernandez v. Fifth Third Bank; Fifth Third Mortgage Company; Jon Ostrander, Area Sales Manager
TOLH2(38907)12052017
22A-2018-00733F

Administrative Closure – Continued

Lesia Kilgo v. New Hillwood I Associates, LLC, The Abel-Bishop & Clarke Realty Co. and Dehawn Partridge

AKRH3(39084)07102017AMENDED

05-17-9534-8

22A-2017-03060F

Fair Housing Advocates Association, Inc. v. New Hillwood I Associates, LLC, The Abel-Bishop & Clarke Realty Co. and Deshawn Partridge

AKRH3(39085)07102017AMENDED

05-17-9535-8

22A-2017-03061F

Diana Lynn Leyman v. John Doss Enterprises, LLC

AKR73(39378)01252018

22A-2018-01213C

Crystal McBride v. Charter Communications, LLC dba Spectrum

AKR73(39413)02122018

22A-2018-01317C

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Flats East Building 4 LLC, The Wolstein Group, LLC, Fairmount Properties LLC, Scott M. Dimit, Dimit Architects, LLC

CLEH4(44434)01142018

22A-2018-01029F

Robert Williams v. Peterbilt Northern Kentucky (The Larson Group)

DAYE6(26911)12142017

22A-2018-00768F

15. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Kevin L. Wells v. OhioHealth dba Grant Medical Center

COLG1(45060)03172017

22A-2018-00327F

Shanea Crabbe v. PNC Bank

COL71(45129)04162017

22A-2017-02253C

Rhonda D. Bennett v. Verizon Corporate Resources Group, LLC

COL71(45173)05012017

22A-2017-02362C

Emmanuel Holt v. Essilor of America

COL71(45174)05012017

22A-2017-02368C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Matthew Stanford v. PF Bethel, LLC dba Planet Fitness
COLG1(45180)05022017
22A-2017-02365F

Matthew Stanford v. Skyline Chili
COLG1(45182)05022017
22A-2017-02364F

Abdikadir Farah v. National Electric Coil Company, L.P.
COL71(45183)05022017
22A-2017-02361C

Angela Graves v. Jerusalem Tours International, Ltd.
COLE1(45196)05052017
22A-2017-02359F

Matthew Stanford v. Drury Inn & Suites
COLG1(45202)05112017
22A-2017-02405F

Matthew Stanford v. Kroger Food & Pharmacy
COLG1(45206)05112017
22A-2017-02407F

Matthew Stanford v. UPS Store
COLG1(45207)05112017
22A-2017-02408F

Chinaza Anosike v. Bryden Place
COL71(45210)05112017
22A-2017-02427C

Eileen G. Hartgrove v. Horton Emergency Vehicles Company
COL71(45221)05152017
22A-2017-02352C

Emmanuel Holt v. Speedway LLC
COLG1(45235)05232017
22A-2017-02538F

Robert Baker v. Jet's Pizza
COLB1(45239)05242017
22A-2017-02520C

Joselyn Parker v. The Columbus Urban League
COL71(45245)05252017
22A-2017-02517C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Clarence J. Woodhouse II v. American Electric Power (AEP)
COLA1(45246)05262017
22A-2017-02534C

LaNita Willis v. State of Ohio, Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services
COLA1(45268)06072017
22A-2017-02726C

Ricardo Bustos v. Lower Lights Christian Health Center
COLB1(45292)06202017
22A-2017-02731C

Amara Moreno v. Drummond Financial Services, LLC
COL71(45298)06212017
22A-2017-02749C

Umesh Tripathy v. West Interactive Services Corporation
COL71(45310)06262017
22A-2017-02783C

Matthew Stanford v. Ollie's Bargain Outlet
COLG1(45435)08152017
22A-2017-03389F

Angela Ramos-Fields v. Sophisticated Systems, Inc.
COLA1(45450)08182017
22A-2017-03416C

David Riebel v. Stanley Electric U.S. Co., Inc.
COL71(45535)09292017
22A-2017-03768C

Jessica Barron v. Fore Meadows Association LLC; Fore Meadows Condominium Association; Rebecca Graber, Statutory Agent; Midland Agency of Northwest Ohio, Inc., Trustee
TOLH2(38414)04142017
22A-2017-01841F

Amanda Stines v. Berch Terrace Mobile Home Park; Haaser Brothers., Inc.; Chrissy Haaser Rocco, Manager
TOLH2(38422)04212017
05-17-8035-8
22A-2017-01963F

Timothy Davidson v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities, Sewer and Drainage
TOLB2(38438)04282017
22A-2017-02092C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Andrew G. Carroll v. Terra State Community College
TOL72(38440)04302017
22A-2017-02106C

Sammie L. Coleman, Jr. v. City of Toledo, Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor
TOL72(38446)05032017
22A-2017-02141C

Phat Chau v. FedEx Ground Package System, Inc.
TOLA2(38449)05042017
22A-2017-02177C

MaDonna Bell-Gray v. Rite Aid
TOL72(38454)05082017
22A-2017-02304C

Melissa Moser v. Kelly Services, Inc.
TOLB2(38470)05152017
22A-2017-02330C

Anthony D. Woodson v. Johns Manville
TOLB2(38481)05232017
22A-2017-02436C

Cody Frye v. Autoneum North America, Inc.
TOL72(38484)05252017
22A-2017-02442C

Mary Jane Schultz v. United Collection Bureau, Inc.
TOL72(38487)05262017
22A-2017-02467C

Crystal M. Barker v. Zepf Center
TOLB2(38509)05302017 AMENDED
22A-2017-02711C

Craig Ranker v. Alfonso Garcia, Jr., Owner
TOLH2(38662)08152017
22A-2017-03408F

Bruce E. Welsh v. Morrison Industrial, LLC dba Material Handling Sales Solutions
AKRA3(38976)05042017
22A-2017-02260C

Jasmin Byrd v. State of Ohio, Department of Youth Services
AKR73(38993)05122017
22A-2017-02376C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Ashanti Byers v. Universal Screen Arts, Inc.
AKRA3(39010)05222017
22A-2017-02423C

Danny Davenport v. The Sherwin-Williams Company
AKRA3(39019)05302017
22A-2017-02530C

Toni Chittock v. AVI Food Systems, Inc.
AKR73(39028)06032017
22A-2017-02611C

Kenneth Chin v. Alorica, Inc.
AKRB3(39033)06062017
22A-2017-02618C

Jersie Spears v. Cracker Barrel Old Country Store, Inc.
AKR73(39048)06142017
22A-2017-02767C

Mark Price v. Leah Stanovich
AKRH3(39050)06162017
05-17-8936-8
22A-2017-02769F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of disability and religion; No Probable Cause on the basis of sex

Leonard J. Bretcko v. The Cafaro Company
AKRB3(39062)06262017AMENDED
22A-2017-02811C

Ederica B. Abramson v. City of Massillon, Police Department
AKR73(39066)06282017
22A-2017-02826C

Michelle E. Phipps v. The J.M. Smucker Company
AKRA3(39106)07192017
22A-2017-03179C

Glenda Berlin v. Rite Aid of Ohio, Inc.
AKRA3(39111)07202017
22A-2017-03183C

Christina Hoffman aka Christina Stewart v. The Bank of New York Mellon
AKRH3(39121)07312017
22A-2017-03219F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Josette Jackson v. Jantech Building Services, Inc.
AKR73(39128)08072017
22A-2017-03293C

Tye Russell v. Bemis Company, Inc.
AKR73(39141)081722017
22A-2017-03387C

Sandra DelSignore v. Youngstown Ohio Hospital Company, LLC dba Northside Regional Medical Center
AKR73(39144)08182017
22A-2017-03450C

Elizabeth Holmes v. Coleman Professional Services, Inc.
AKRA3(39151)08232017
22A-2017-03497C

Donnell White v. Evolution Energy Trucking Company, LLC
AKR73(39161)08302017
22A-2017-03627C

Elizabeth Holmes v. Coleman Professional Services, Inc.
AKR73(39292)11272017AMENDED
22A-2018-00555C

Mikaela C. Johnson v. Superior Dairy, Inc.
AKR73(39300)11302017
22A-2018-00612C

James Humbert v. Mary Hawes, City of Geneva-on-the-Lake, Police Department, Gary and Brittany Breedlove
AKRH4(44091)07062017
22A-2017-03069F

*Split Determination: No Probable Cause on the basis of disability, ancestry and retaliation discrimination by Respondents Mary Hawes, Gary and Brittany Breedlove; No Jurisdiction on the basis of disability, ancestry and retaliation discrimination by Respondent Geneva-on-the-Lake

Keoynia Farris v. Rebecca Skrinak
AKRH4(44134)07092017AMENDED
05-17-0571-8
22A-2017-03357F

Theresa Crow v. Antaniesha Hammett, Timberlake Apartments, Limited Partnership, Yarco Company, Inc. and Diane Korstad
AKRH4(44136)07122017AMENDED
05-17-9724-8
22A-2017-03460F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Mitchell DeVan v. Yelena Ganyukov, Viktor Gavrylyuk and Georgetown of Lyndhurst Condominiums
Unit Owners' Association
AKRH4(44137)07132017
05-17-9174-8
22A-2017-03351F

*Split Determination: No Probable Cause on issues regarding Respondent Viktor Gavrylyuk; Withdrawal of Charge on the issues regarding Respondent Yelena Ganyukov and Respondent Georgetown of Lyndhurst Condominiums Unit Owners' Association

Judith Godfrey v. Georgetown of the Highlands Condominium Owners' Association, David Boylan,
Frank DiNardo and Al Yedid
AKRH4(44153)08112017
05-17-9256-8
22A-2017-03358F

Rylee Herron v. Plum Creek Two LLC and Redwood Management
CLEH4(39059)06232017
05-17-9234-8
22A-2017-02813F

Ericka James v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
CLE74(44023)05262017
22A-2017-02567C

Michelle Wells v. Carrington Mortgage Services, LLC and Wilmington Saving Fund Society, FSB, as
Trustee for the Stanwich Mortgage Loan Trust A
CLEH4(44034)06012017
22A-2017-02582F

Deanna Nwosu v. Maria Tsimpiris, Dimitrious Tsimpiris, Stephen . Tsimpiris, Christian Tsimpiris, The
Maple Gardens Condominium Association
CLEE4(44037)06012017
05-17-9012-8
22A-2017-02617F

Ericka James v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
CLEA4(44068)06232017
22A-2017-02816C

Leonard Burnett v. Colonade West Partners, Ltd., Windsor Realty & Management, Inc., Donald Porz,
and Jessie Scott
CLEH4(44105)05302017
05-17-9494-8
22A-2017-03085F

James Petro v. County of Cuyahoga
CLE74(44186)08252017
22A-2017-03511C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Debra Hines v. Cuyahoga County
CLE74(44203)09062017
22A-2017-03595C

James Walls v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
CLE74(44211)09112017
22A-2017-03696C

Christopher A. Carney v. Young Men’s Christian Association of Greater Cleveland
CLEB4(44217)09182017
22A-2017-03756C

Filandus Boyd v. Shaker Heights City School District
CLE74(44230)09202017
22A-2017-03806C

David Wrice v. Montrose KIA, LLC
CLE74(44259)10102017
22A-2018-00151C

Jamahl Henderson v. Magnus Engineered Equipment, LLC
CLE74(44276)10182017
22A-2018-00191C

Sarata Kande v. The MetroHealth System
CLE74(44277)10192017
22A-2018-00192C

Amanda Sims v. American Kidney Institute, LLC
CLE74(44290)10242017
22A-2018-00275C

Kimberlee Nagle v. Rocky River Dental Association – William L. Farr, D.D.S., Inc.
CLEE4(44306)11032017
22A-2017-00373F

Terrance Wilcoxson v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
CLE74(44316)11062017
22A-2018-00381C

Denise Hickle v. Rocky River Dental Association – William L. Farr, D.D.S, Inc.
CLEE4(44319)05302017
22A-2018-00396F

Ebony White v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLE74(44338)11152017
22A-2018-00470C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Mary E. Rice v. Cuyahoga County Board of Election
CLEG4(44348)11212017
22A-2018-00550F

Anita Rivers v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLEA4(44351)11282017
22A-2018-00568C

Shirley Keller v. Marc Glassman, Inc.
CLEA4(44377)12082017
22A-2018-00756C

Kenneth McKenzie v. FedEx Freight, Inc.
CLE73(39163)08312017
22A-2017-03584C

Jeffrey Moore v. Dayton Progress Corporation
DAYA6(26335)04062017
22A-2017-02146C

Gloria Robinson v. Clovernook Center for the Blind and Visually Impaired
DAY76(26395)04282017
22A-2017-02226C

Nashoria Katassa Smith v. Lima Anesthesia & Pain Treatment, PC
DAY76(26376)04242017
22A-2017-02121C

Bertha Bennett v. Panera Bread Café
DAYG6(26382)04272017
22A-2017-02153F

Bertha Bennett v. Extra Ordinary (EO) Burgers
DAYG6(26383)04272017
22A-2017-02152F

Bertha Bennett v. BD's Mongolian Grill
DAYG6(26384)04272017
22A-2017-02148F

Bertha Bennett v. BL Restaurant Operations, LLC
DAYG6(26385)04272017
22A-2017-02149F

Bertha Bennett v. The Cheese Cake Factory Restaurants, Inc.
DAYG6(26386)04272017
22A-2017-02151F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Forest B. Wortham v. Wright State University College of Liberal Arts
DAYA6(26390)04262017
22A-2017-02120C

Alicia Fair v. Kettering Health Network
DAYB6(26393)04272017
22A-2017-02507C

Monica Goodloe v. Joseph “Zeke” Aldredge
DAYH6(26396)04262017
22A-2017-02159F

Jo’el Thomas-Jones v. Armed Forces Services Corporation
DAY76(26402)05012017
22A-2017-02571C

Deborah Wilcox v. Antioch University dba Antioch University Midwest
DAY76(26405)05022017
22A-2017-02240C

Dylan Michael Keen v. TJK – ELS Inc., d/b/a Domino’s Pizza
DAYB6(26432)05152017
22A-2017-02489C

Craig Martin Howell v. Jefferson Township, Montgomery County, Ohio
DAY76(26435)05152017
22A-2017-02477C

Teresa Daniels v. Cincinnati Comprehensive Pain Specialist
DAYG6(26436)05172017
22A-2017-02491F

Erica C. Pugh v. Indu Raj Soin Medical Center
DAY76(26437)05192017
22A-2017-02479C

Madeleine Kipperman v. Randstad Holdings LLC
DAY76(26444)05182017
22A-2017-02597C

Tonda McClellan v. Starbucks Corporation dba Starbucks Coffee Company
DAYA6(26445)05202017
22A-2017-02680C

Nichole Capasso v. Village of Gettysburg, Ohio
DAY76(26464)05222017
22A-2017-02909C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Andrea King v. ADVICS Manufacturing Ohio
DAY76(26477)05302017
22A-2017-02671C

Franklin Casey v. Sugar Creek Packing Co.
DAYB6(26480)05312017
22A-2017-02672C

Zachary Coffey v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
DAY76(26483)06012017
22A-2017-02678C

Walter Watson v. J. Gumbo's Blue Ash, LLC
DAY76(26489)06022017
22A-2017-02910C

Kim Marshall-Coleman v. Dayton Children's Hospital
DAYB6(26490)06062017
22A-2017-03007C

LeNay Dicks v. Wine Cellar Innovations
DAY76(26501)06112017
22A-2017-02900C

Carla Pitsinger v. St. Vincent DePaul Women & Family Shelter
DAYH6(26529)06262017
22A-2017-02998F

Parrish Lattimore v. Innomark Communications, Inc.
DAY76(26709)09112017
22A-2017-03699C

Keiana Rogers v. Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center
DAY76(26715)09132017
22A-2017-03703C

Brandi Croley v. Corban Early Learning Center
DAY76(26716)09132017
22A-2017-03704C

Pamela Wendel on Behalf of Minor Child v. Chic-Fil-A Voice of America
DAYB6(26734)09262017
22A-2017-03818C

Alice Folson v. City of Cincinnati, Greater Cincinnati Water Works
DAY76(26744)09282017
22A-2018-00003C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Bernadette Blackman v. Mature Services, Inc.
DAYB6(26771)10122017
22A-2018-00159C

Bernadette Blackman v. Catholic Charities of Southwest Ohio
DAYB6(26772)10122017
22A-2018-00161C

Melody Rembert v. Pristine Senior Living of Norwood Towers
DAY76(26776)10122017
22A-2018-00163C

Weda Turner v. KAO Collins, Inc.
DAY76(26778)10122017
22A-2018-00193C

Portia Woodward v. Arbor E&T, LLC dba ResCare Workforce Services
DAYB6(26781)10162017
22A-2018-00194C

Jawon McIntosh v. The Children's Home of Cincinnati, Ohio
DAY76(26782)10162017
22A-2018-00195C

Pamela S. Lawson v. Smith's Boathouse Restaurant, LLC
DAYB6(26792)10192017
22A-2018-00232C

Elijah Lange v. Frutarom US Inc.
DAY76(26808)11022017
22A-2018-00369C

Kasi South v. H. Hafner & Sons, Inc.
DAY76(26810)11042017
22A-2018-00362C

Kimberly Wilson v. Ashley Kidd, et al.
DAYH6(26816)10162017
22A-2018-00378F

Glenn Meyers v. The Cedars of River Bend; Management
DAYH6(26822)09072017
22A-2018-00386F

Denise Harp v. Ohio Valley Goodwill Industries
DAY76(26840)11142017
22A-2018-00482C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Jessica Wilson v. Bill Marine Honda
DAY76(26864)11302017
22A-2018-00588C

William Beahr v. Homestar Solutions, LLC dba Mr. Handyman of Greater Cincinnati/NKY
DAYB6(26869)12042017
22A-2018-00674C

Linda Hazel-Sandridge v. Montgomery County Job & Family Services
DAYA6(26939)01042018
22A-2018-01003C

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to approve the February 22, 2018 Confirmation Agenda. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Director informed those present that the Commission had complied with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

APPEARANCE CASES

Appearance 1

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Jeremiah Waseleski v. Dalcan, LLC dba Panera Bread
CLE74(44036)06012017
22A-2017-02584C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 2

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Jeremiah Waseleski v. Dalcan, LLC dba Panera Bread
CLEB4(44047)06092017
22A-2017-02640C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 3

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Jeremiah Waseleski v. Dalcan, LLC dba Panera Bread
CLEB4(44048)06092017
22A-2017-02641C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 4

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Jeremiah Waseleski v. Dalcan, LLC dba Panera Bread
CLE74(44062)06192017
22A-2017-02794C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 5

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 1, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Travis E. V. Simpson v. Jordan Restaurant Group, LLC dba Popeye's Chicken
COL71(45412)08032017
22A-2017-03256C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

**Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1
Page 1 of 1**

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Dwayne K. Taylor v. OhioHealth Corporation, Grant Medical Center
COLG1(45068)03272017
22A-2017-02142F

Dwayne K. Taylor v. OhioHealth Corporation, Grant Medical Center
COLG1(45301)06232017
22A-2017-02752F

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2
Page 1 of 1

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Chante Tibby v. State of Ohio, Opportunities for Ohioans with Disabilities
CLE71(45302)06232017
22A-2017-02759C

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3
Page 1 of 2

1. Request For Reconsideration: Respondent's Request - Deny

Darnell Smith v. Orchard Farms Apartments; Brad D'Arcangelo, Owner; Karen Apodaca, Property Manager; J.B. Enterprises, LTD.
TOLH2(38383)03292017
05-17-7800-8
22A-2017-01686F

2. Request For Reconsideration: Reverse Probable Cause to No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Boris Sar v. Cherokee Nation Management & Consulting, LLC
DAY76(26429)05122017
22A-2017-02461C

3. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Beth Breckenridge v. Hondros College Inc., dba Hondros College of Business
COLB1(45099)04042017 AMENDED
22A-2017-02246C

Christopher F. Adams v. TVI, inc. dba Savers
TOL72(38415)04172017
22A-2017-01884C

Raynard Armstrong v. BP-Husky Refining, LLC
TOLA2(38425)04242017
22A-2017-01989C

4. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

James Washington v. Sage Acquisitions LLC
COLH6(26593)04122017
22A-2017-03770F

Michelle Martino v. County of Stark, Regional Community Correction Center
AKRG3(39004)05192017
22A-2017-02406F

Linda Kay Porter v. John Doss Enterprises, LLC
AKRE3(39206)09132017
22A-2017-03836F

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3
Page 2 of 2

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss - Continued

Bridgett Farkas v. Indian Creek School District Board of Education
AKRK3(39337)01052018
22A-2018-01034F

Roger and Marta Francis v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority, Melinda Lee James Casey and U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development
AKRH3(39366)01022018
05-18-0308-8
22A-2018-01084F

James Humbert v. Mary Hawes, City of Geneva-on-the-Lake, Police Department, Gary and Brittany Breedlove
AKRH4(44091)07062017
22A-2017-03069F

*Split Determination – No Jurisdiction on the basis of disability, ancestry and retaliation by Respondent Geneva-on-the-Lake; No Probable Cause on the basis of disability, ancestry and retaliation by Respondents Mary Hawes, Gary and Brittany Breedlove

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office

Sharon Tassie, Assistant Civil Rights Section Chief – Ohio Attorney General's Office reported that in the last 3 weeks the AG's office completed fair housing training for approximately 60 people.

Report from the Chief Legal Counsel

Chief Legal Counsel Stephanie Demers reported that yesterday the United States Supreme Court delivered a decision concerning the anti-retaliation provisions of the Sarbanes-Oxley and Dodd-Frank Acts. While both of these federal statutes were enacted to shield whistleblowers from retaliation by their employers for reporting securities fraud, she enjoy studying analysis from courts with respect to any retaliation case.

In short, the VP of a real estate investment trust, reported suspected securities law violations to senior management. He did not report directly to the SEC. Of course he was subsequently terminated.

The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002 protects all employees who report misconduct to the SEC or any other federal agency, Congress or an internal supervisor. Enter the Dodd-Frank Act, enacted in 2010, and which amended the SEA. The D-F's anti-retaliation provision protects those who provide information to the SEC; who initiate, testify or assist in an investigation, or make disclosures as required or protected under the S-O, the SEA criminal anti-retaliation prohibitions found in 18 U.S.C. 1513(3) or any other law rule or regulation subject to the jurisdiction of the SEC.

The D-F reporting structure is narrow, protecting whistleblowers who are specifically defined as persons who provide information relating to a violation of the securities laws to the SEC.

The VP did not file an administrative complaint prior to filing a federal lawsuit. (The Sarbanes-Oxley Act requires administrative exhaustion). Consequently, he could not allege retaliation under this law in federal court. Therefore, the issue before the court was whether the employee's reporting misconduct to senior management invoke the protections of the Dodd-Frank Act?

The Court could have gone two ways. Follow the 9th and 2nd Circuit Court of Appeals in liberally construing retaliation to extend under the S-O Act to the employee as long as he or she provides information in a manner shielded by one of the three anti-retaliation shields of retaliation, which in this case was a report to a supervisor. Conversely, take a narrow strict statutory reading as interpreted by the 5th Circuit, which means directly reporting to the SEC. The Supreme Court took the latter finding because the VP did not directly report the conduct to the SEC, he was not afforded protection under the Dodd-Frank Act.

Employees are not always as educated in their rights and responsibilities. They are led to believe if they do the right thing and risk employment suicide, they will be protected. The Court's narrow strict construction is concerning because those who report should be afforded protection under any retaliation clause intended to protect employees, whether for reporting securities fraud as in this case or discrimination, as in our case.

Report from Executive Director

Executive Director, G. Michael Payton began his report by informing the Commissioners that the United States Supreme Court has heard oral argument for the "masterpiece cake" case. This is a case involving a baker who allegedly refused to prepare a wedding cake for a same-sex couple due to his religious values. Director Payton will keep the Commission updated on the court's decision.

Following the OCRC's testimony on the gay rights legislation (House Bill 160), a lobbyist representing Citizens for Community Values requested a meeting to discuss the Commission's support for the legislation. This group believes the enforcement of anti-discrimination provisions to protect gay individuals trammels upon the rights of citizens who do not support such rights for religious reasons. The organization is requesting an opportunity to appear before the Commissioners to present their views on the legislation.

The Columbus Dispatch published a recent article on a housing discrimination study. The study found that African Americans and Latinos have a harder time qualifying for and receiving home loans even when controlling for income, loan amount and neighborhood. Columbus was the only metro area in Ohio with no statistically significant evidence of racial discrimination in lending although blacks are twice more likely to be denied a loan than whites.

Dayton Regional Director Duffy Jamieson was interviewed on Cincinnati television station WCPO on February 7th regarding sexual harassment in the workplace and the #METOO movement.

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	ABSENT
Acting Chairman William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	ABSENT
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 10:53AM.



* * *

Commissioner